



Subtracting Square Roots Repeatedly: 10568

Donald E. Knuth; Denis Constaes

The American Mathematical Monthly, Vol. 106, No. 2. (Feb., 1999), p. 167.

Stable URL:

<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0002-9890%28199902%29106%3A2%3C167%3ASSRR1%3E2.0.CO%3B2-C>

The American Mathematical Monthly is currently published by Mathematical Association of America.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/about/terms.html>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/journals/maa.html>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

The JSTOR Archive is a trusted digital repository providing for long-term preservation and access to leading academic journals and scholarly literature from around the world. The Archive is supported by libraries, scholarly societies, publishers, and foundations. It is an initiative of JSTOR, a not-for-profit organization with a mission to help the scholarly community take advantage of advances in technology. For more information regarding JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

10716. Proposed by Michael L. Catalano-Johnson and Daniel Loeb, Daniel Wagner Associates, Malvern, PA. What is the largest cubical present that can be completely wrapped (without cutting) by a unit square of wrapping paper?

10717. Proposed by Marcin Mazur, University of Chicago, Chicago, IL. We say that a tetrahedron is *rigid* if it is determined by its volume, the areas of its faces, and the radius of its circumscribed sphere. We say that a tetrahedron is *very rigid* if it is determined just by the areas of its faces and the radius of its circumscribed sphere.

(a) Prove that every tetrahedron with faces of equal area is rigid.

(b) Prove that a very rigid tetrahedron with faces of equal area is regular.

(c)* Is every tetrahedron rigid?

(d)* Is every very rigid tetrahedron regular?

SOLUTIONS

Subtracting Square Roots Repeatedly

10568 [1997, 68]. Proposed by Donald E. Knuth, Stanford University, Stanford, CA. Let n be a nonnegative integer. The sequence defined by $x_0 = n$ and $x_{k+1} = x_k - \lceil \sqrt{x_k} \rceil$ for $k \geq 0$ converges to 0. Let $f(n)$ be the number of steps required; i.e., $x_{f(n)} = 0$ but $x_{f(n)-1} > 0$. Find a closed form for $f(n)$.

Solution by Denis Constaes, University of Gent, Gent, Belgium. Every positive integer n can be written uniquely in the form $p^2 - q$, where p and q are integers satisfying $p \geq 1$ and $0 \leq q \leq 2p - 2$ (take $p = \lceil \sqrt{n} \rceil$ and $q = p^2 - n$). We call this *standard form* for n . We obtain the desired formula in terms of these parameters p and q .

Using standard form, let $n' = n - \lceil \sqrt{n} \rceil = p^2 - (q + p)$. We distinguish two cases.
Case 1: $p - 1 \leq q \leq 2p - 2$. We rewrite n' as $(p - 1)^2 - (q - (p - 1))$. Since $q \geq p - 1$, this expresses n' in standard form with $p' = p - 1$ and $q' = q - (p - 1)$ (when $p > 2$).
Case 2: $0 \leq q \leq p - 1$. Now $n' = p^2 - (q + p)$ is standard form for n' with $p' = p$ and $q' = q + p$. The next value $n'' = n' - \lceil \sqrt{n'} \rceil = p^2 - (q + 2p)$. Expressed in standard form, this is $n'' = (p - 1)^2 - (q + 1)$ (when $p > 2$).

We have applied the transformation once in Case 1 and twice in Case 2. Thus

$$f(p^2 - q) = \begin{cases} 2 + f((p - 1)^2 - (q + 1)) & \text{if } 0 \leq q \leq p - 2 \\ 1 + f((p - 1)^2 - (q - p + 1)) & \text{if } p - 1 \leq q \leq 2p - 2 \end{cases}$$

whenever $p > 2$ and $0 \leq q \leq 2p - 2$. The cases $p \leq 2$ occur for $n \in \{1, 2, 3, 4\}$, where $f(n) = 1, 1, 2, 2$, respectively. With the recurrence, these initial conditions define f . Our closed form is

$$f(p^2 - q) = \begin{cases} 2p - \lfloor \log_2(p + q) \rfloor - 1 & \text{if } 0 \leq q \leq p - 1 \\ 2p - \lfloor \log_2 q \rfloor - 2 & \text{if } p \leq q \leq 2p - 2 \end{cases}$$

for integers p, q such that $1 \leq p$ and $0 \leq q \leq 2p - 2$. Also, we set $f(0) = 0$.

The proof of the formula is immediate by induction, using the recurrence in the three cases $0 \leq q \leq p - 2$, $q = p - 1$, and $p \leq q \leq 2p - 2$. The only simplification needed occurs in the second case, where $\lceil \log_2(2p - 1) \rceil = 1 + \lceil \log_2(p - 1) \rceil$, which follows immediately when $p > 1$.

Editorial comment. Robin J. Chapman and the GCHQ Problems Group expressed $f(n)$ using the single formula $f(n) = \lfloor 4n + 2^{m+3} - 3 \rfloor - (m + 2)$, where $m = \lfloor \log_2(\sqrt{n} + 1) \rfloor$.

Solved also by T. Amdeberhan, K. L. Bernstein, R. J. Chapman (U. K.), D. A. Darling, M. N. Deshpande & N. N. Kasturiwale (India), K. Ferguson, R. Holzinger, W. Janous (Austria), F. Kemp, P. G. Kirmser, N. Komanda, Y. Kong, J. H. Lindsey II, W. A. Newcomb, C. R. Pranesachar (India), K. Schilling, J. H. Steelman, D. Trautman, X. Wang, D. Yuen, GCHQ Problems Group (U. K.), Westmont Problems Group, and the proposer.