



## The Plane Covered by Disks: 10440

Marius Cavachi; Sam Northshield; Simeon T. Stefanov; Victor Klee

*The American Mathematical Monthly*, Vol. 106, No. 4. (Apr., 1999), pp. 364-365.

Stable URL:

<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0002-9890%28199904%29106%3A4%3C364%3ATPCBD1%3E2.0.CO%3B2-U>

*The American Mathematical Monthly* is currently published by Mathematical Association of America.

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/about/terms.html>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/journals/maa.html>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

---

The JSTOR Archive is a trusted digital repository providing for long-term preservation and access to leading academic journals and scholarly literature from around the world. The Archive is supported by libraries, scholarly societies, publishers, and foundations. It is an initiative of JSTOR, a not-for-profit organization with a mission to help the scholarly community take advantage of advances in technology. For more information regarding JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

Given  $f \in P$  with period  $2\pi n$ , we form a path from  $f(x)$  to  $\sin x$  via the homotopy  $h_t(x) = (1-t)f(x) + t \sin x$  for  $0 \leq t \leq 1$ . Since  $\|h_s - h_t\| \leq (\|f\| + 1)|s - t|$ , the map  $t \mapsto h_t$  is continuous from  $[0, 1]$  to the space of all functions from  $\mathbb{R}$  to  $\mathbb{R}$  with the topology derived from the supremum norm. Each  $h_t$  has  $2n\pi$  as a period. This gives the desired path in  $P$  if no  $h_t(x)$  is constant, i.e., unless  $f(x) = A \sin x + B$  with  $A < 0$ . For such  $f(x)$ , the path  $k_t(x) = (1-t)f(x) - t \sin x$  connects  $f(x)$  to  $-\sin x = \sin(x + \pi)$ . The path  $n_t(x) = \sin(x + (1-t)\pi)$  then connects  $-\sin x$  to  $\sin x$  in  $P$ . The continuity of  $t \mapsto n_t$  follows from the mean value theorem. If  $f$  and  $g$  have commensurate periods, say both are a multiple of  $p$ , then there are continuous paths in  $P$  connecting  $f(x)$  to  $\sin(2\pi x/p)$  and  $g(x)$  to  $\sin(2\pi x/p)$ , hence there is a path from  $f$  to  $g$ .

For a fixed real number  $p$ , let  $C_p$  denote the set of functions in  $P$  whose period is a rational multiple of  $p$ . We now show that  $C_p$  is an open subset of  $P$ . Choose  $f \in C_p$ . Since  $f$  is not constant, there are real numbers  $x$  and  $y$  such that  $f(x) < f(y)$ . Set  $\epsilon = (f(y) - f(x))/3$ . We show that  $g \in P$  and  $\|f - g\| < \epsilon$  implies  $g \in C_p$ . If not, then there is  $g$  with  $\|f - g\| < \epsilon$  such that the period of  $g$ , say  $q$ , is an irrational multiple of  $p$ . Since  $f$  is continuous, there is  $\delta$  such that  $f$  takes the interval  $(y - \delta, y + \delta)$  into the interval  $(f(y) - \epsilon, f(y) + \epsilon)$ . Since  $f \in C_p$ ,  $f$  also takes the interval  $(y - mp - \delta, y - mp + \delta)$  into  $(f(y) - \epsilon, f(y) + \epsilon)$  for each integer  $m$ . Since  $\|f - g\| < \epsilon$ ,  $g$  takes each  $(y - mp - \delta, y - mp + \delta)$  into  $(f(y) - 2\epsilon, f(y) + 2\epsilon)$ . Since  $p/q$  is irrational, the numbers  $mp + nq$  for integers  $m$  and  $n$  are dense in  $\mathbb{R}$ , so there are integers  $m$  and  $n$  such that  $mp + nq \in (y - x - \delta, y - x + \delta)$ , which gives  $x + nq \in (y - mp - \delta, y - mp + \delta)$ . Thus,  $g(x + nq) < f(x) + \epsilon = f(y) - 2\epsilon < g(x + nq)$ , a contradiction. This completes the proof that  $C_p$  is an open subset of  $P$ .

Since the sets  $C_p$  partition  $P$  into connected open sets, each set  $C_p$  is a component of  $P$ .

### The Plane Covered by Disks

**10440** [1995, 273]. *Proposed by Marius Cavachi, Constanta, Romania.* Show that the Euclidean plane cannot be covered with circular disks having mutually disjoint interiors.

*Solution I by Sam Northshield, SUNY, Plattsburgh, NY.* We show that  $\mathbb{R}^k$  ( $k \geq 2$ ) cannot be covered by metric balls having mutually disjoint interiors.

Note that every set of balls with disjoint interiors is countable, since each contains a different point with rational coordinates. Let  $\{B_n: n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  be a set of closed metric balls in  $\mathbb{R}^k$  ( $k \geq 2$ ) with mutually disjoint interiors. A point of intersection of two of the  $B_n$  is called an *intersection point*. Since the intersection of two distinct  $B_n$  has at most one point, there are only countably many intersection points. Hence we may choose a straight line segment  $\gamma$  with its endpoints in the interiors of two distinct balls and such that  $\gamma$  avoids all intersection points (here is where we need  $k \geq 2$ ). Let  $C$  be the set of points of  $\gamma$  that are *not* in the interior of any  $B_n$ . Then  $C$  is closed and nonempty. Furthermore, any neighborhood of point  $x \in C$  must contain another point of  $C$ ; otherwise  $x$  would be an intersection point. Hence  $C$  is perfect, and thus uncountable. Now, for any  $n$ , the segment  $\gamma$  intersects  $\partial B_n$  in at most two points, so there is  $x \in C$  not in any  $B_n$ . It follows that  $\bigcup B_n \neq \mathbb{R}^k$ .

*Solution II by Simeon T. Stefanov, Sofia, Bulgaria.* Suppose the contrary. As in Solution I, there are only countably many intersection points. Let  $L$  be a line that avoids these points, and consider the family  $\mathcal{F} = \{L \cap B_n: n \in \mathbb{N}\}$ , a countable cover of  $L$  with disjoint closed bounded intervals. To see that no such cover is possible, construct a nested family of compact intervals  $\Delta_n \subseteq L$  such that  $\Delta_n \cap B_n = \emptyset$ , but  $\Delta_n$  meets at least two intervals in  $\mathcal{F}$ . Then  $\bigcap \Delta_n$  is nonempty, but no point of this intersection belongs to any set in  $\mathcal{F}$ .

*Editorial comment.* Victor Klee noted that the proof that there are only countably many intersection points requires only that the  $B_n$  be *rotund* (i.e., strictly convex). His solution followed Solution II, with the last part traced back to W. Sierpiński, Un théorème sur les

continus, *Tôhoku Mat. J.* 13 (1918) 300–303. Klee also noted that circular disks are *smooth* (i.e., possess a continuously differentiable parameterization) as well as *rotund*. For more on smooth tilings, see V. Klee, E. Maluta, and C. Zanco, Tiling with smooth and rotund tiles, *Fund. Math.* 126 (1986) 269–290; V. Klee and C. Tricot, Locally countable plump tilings are flat, *Math. Ann.* 277 (1987) 315–325; and P. M. Gruber, How well can space be packed with smooth bodies? Measure theoretic results, *J. London Math. Soc.* (2) 52 (1995) 1–14.

D. G. Larman, A note on the Besicovich dimension of the closest packing of sphere in  $\mathbb{R}_n$ , *Proc. Cambridge Philos. Soc.* 62 (1966) 193–195 shows that, in the case of packing of circular disks in the plane, the uncovered set has Hausdorff dimension at least 1.03.

Solved also by G. E. Bredon, P. Budney, J. D. Clemens, J. Cobb, R. Holzsager, A. A. Jagers (The Netherlands), V. Klee, J. H. Lindsey II, O. P. Lossers (The Netherlands), R. Martin (Germany), L. E. Mattics, M. Misiurewicz, I. Namioka, O. Nanyes, C. G. Petalas & T. P. Vidalis (Greece), C. Popescu (Belgium), A. W. Schurle, J. H. Shapiro & T. L. McCoy, A. A. Tarabay & R. Barbara (Lebanon), and the Anchorage Math Solutions Group.

### Random Perfect Matchings

**10587** [1997, 361]. *Proposed by Joaquín Gómez Rey, Madrid, Spain.* Let  $K_{2n}$  be the complete graph on  $2n$  vertices. Let  $P_n$  be the probability that two random perfect matchings of  $K_{2n}$  are disjoint. What is  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P_n$ ?

*Solution by José Heber Nieto, Universidad del Zulia, Maracaibo, Venezuela.* The limit is  $e^{-1/2} \approx 0.60653$ . The number of perfect matchings of  $K_{2n}$  is  $M_n = (2n)!/(2^n n!)$ . Given a perfect matching  $G$  of  $K_{2n}$  and a set  $J$  of  $j$  edges of  $G$ , there are  $M_{n-j}$  perfect matchings of  $K_{2n}$  containing  $J$ . Therefore, the inclusion-exclusion principle yields  $\sum_{j=0}^n (-1)^j \binom{n}{j} M_{n-j}$  as the number of perfect matchings of  $K_{2n}$  disjoint from  $G$ . Thus

$$P_n = \sum_{j=0}^n (-1)^j \binom{n}{j} \frac{M_{n-j}}{M_n}.$$

Now  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P_n$  can be computed by applying Lebesgue's dominated convergence theorem. Let  $X = \{0, 1, 2, \dots\}$ , and define a measure  $\mu$  on  $X$  by  $\mu(\{j\}) = 1/j!$ . Let  $f_n: X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be defined by

$$f_n(j) = \frac{(-1)^j n! M_{n-j}}{(n-j)! M_n} = (-1)^j \prod_{i=0}^{j-1} \frac{n-i}{2n-2i-1}.$$

Then  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f_n(j) = (-1/2)^j$ . Furthermore,  $|f_n(j)| \leq 1$ , and the constant function 1 is integrable, since  $\int_X 1 d\mu = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} 1/j! = e$ . Therefore,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P_n = \lim \int_X f_n d\mu = \int_X \lim f_n d\mu = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \frac{(-1/2)^j}{j!} = e^{-1/2}.$$

Solved also by R. J. Chapman (U. K.), R. DiSario, J. Grossman, J. Labelle, D. Tenny, NCCU Problems Group, and the proposer.

### Characterizations of the Medial Triangle

**10588** [1997, 361]. *Proposed by Marcin Mazur, The University of Chicago, Chicago, IL.* Let  $A_1 A_2 A_3$  be a triangle. For  $i = 1, 2, 3$ , let  $B_i$  be a point on side  $A_{i+1} A_{i+2}$ , where subscripts are taken modulo 3.

(a) Show that  $|A_i B_{i+1}| + |B_i B_{i+1}| = |A_i B_{i+2}| + |B_i B_{i+2}|$  for  $i = 1, 2, 3$  if and only if  $B_i$  is the midpoint of  $A_{i+1} A_{i+2}$  for  $i = 1, 2, 3$ .

(b) Show that  $|A_i B_{i+1}| + |A_i B_{i+2}| = |B_i B_{i+1}| + |B_i B_{i+2}|$  for  $i = 1, 2, 3$  if and only if  $B_i$  is the midpoint of  $A_{i+1} A_{i+2}$  for  $i = 1, 2, 3$ .